

# HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

## MINUTES

Monday, June 2, 2014 2:00

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



### Call to Order.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

### Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Bert Bender

Donna Bosold

Ray Rhash

Jim Clupper, absent

Staff: Rey Ortiz, County Planner

Steve Williams, Assistant County Attorney

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

### Adoption of Minutes from the March 3, 2014 meeting.

Ray Rhash motioned to approve the minutes of the April 7, 2014 meeting. Bert Bender seconded the motion.

### Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. HAROLD McMAHON is proposing a revision to previous approval for a rectangular pool (1/6/14), with partial concrete deck and equipment pad at his property located at 198 Lowe Street. The subject property is legally described as BK 3 AMD Plat of Tavernier Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00566320-000000.

### Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

### Applicant presentation

David Dehaas represented the owner. He noted this is a small revision to a previous approval.

### Public testimony

Jeff Hale, neighbor at 224 Tavernier Drive, had no objections to the proposal.

### Board discussion

There was no discussion from the board.

### **Motion**

Bert Bender motioned to approve. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. All were in favor of the motion.

2. RAUL AND MARIA SANTAMARINA are proposing to install an elevator to provide access between floors at 231 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as Lot 4 and adjacent bay bottom, Block 8, Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00477830-000000. (tabled at the meetings February 3, 2014 and April 7, 2014).

### **Applicant presentation of new material**

Peter Schwartz, Cornerstone Construction, represented the project. He compared two surveys of property, saying one shows the building more centered. He noted John Gilbert, also of Cornerstone Construction, had attended the previous meetings on this proposal, and said it would be too expensive to move the elevator location to the other side of the building. They would have to build a mezzanine. The elevator would have to be located at the stairway landing which is against the building code. Their proposed location makes the most sense. It does not matter which side it is located on as far as visibility from the street. Moving the elevator to the opposite side would require that he remodel half of the house.

### **Public testimony**

Jeff Hale, the neighbor at 224 Tavernier Drive, said he and the other neighbors have no problem with the desired location. He said Mr. Santamarina's knees are very bad.

### **Staff response**

Rey Ortiz noted that cargo lifts are not allowed on residential properties. It must be an enclosed elevator. The Historic Preservation Commission should look at the elevator location and not the model as they may vary.

### **Board discussion**

Bert Bender said that John Gilbert had asked him to visit the property. You are asking to put the elevator on the west side with the smaller setback. This would require a variance. Variances are granted if there is a hardship. By hardship they do not mean a human physical hardship, it refers to having no other options for locating an item on a property.

Steve Williams said the hardship cannot be self-imposed. In this case you have another option, locating it on the east side. The west side of the structure would require a variance.

Mr. Schwartz said the one survey shows the building in the middle of the lot.

Mr. Bender said both surveys are showing the same thing.

### **Motion**

Bert Bender motioned to deny this application. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. All voted in

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, June 2, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 3 of 3

favor of the motion and, therefore, the motion carries.

**Other Business:**

Discussion on possible revisions to Article III. Archaeological, Historical or Cultural Landmarks, Municode.

Bert Bender motioned to work on modification of the ordinance to allow for staff approvals. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

Steve Williams had presented a chart with different categories of possible property modifications that would be subject to review for the Commission to review to see whether they felt the item could be approved at staff level or if it needs full review by the HPC.

David Dehaas was also in favor of making these changes. He suggested possibly setting thresholds on the kinds of things staff could approve, for example, additions less than 100 square feet.

Donna Bosold and Alice Allen were okay with staff approvals not visible from the street.

Ms. Allen suggested distinguishing between contributing and non-contributing structures. For example an awning on a non-contributing structure would not be a problem, but it could be on a contributing structure.

Mr. Bender said he would like to see people apply for paint color approval even though they do not need a building permit.

Mr. Williams explained there could be some issues with regulating paint color.

The Commission began discussing each item on the chart. All agreed that new construction and additions should go to the HPC.

Ms. Allen said she would be uncomfortable with staff approving demolitions as many buildings here are just coming of age.

Items like elevating structures, placement of mechanical equipment, solar panels and other energy saving devices, and crawl space infill will be added to the chart.

Mr. Williams said he will meet with Diane and Rey and continue to work on this.

**Adjournment.**

As there was no other business, the meeting was adjourned.