

# HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

## MINUTES

Monday, September 8, 2014 2:00

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



### Call to Order.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

### Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Donna Bosold

Ray Rhash

Bert Bender, absent

Jim Clupper, absent

Staff: Rey Ortiz, County Planner

Steve Williams, County Attorney

Peter Morris, County Attorney

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

### Adoption of Minutes from the August 4, 2014 meeting.

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the minutes of the August 4, 2014 meeting. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.

### Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. SUSAN PARKER, KALEY MILLER AND JUSTIN MILLER are proposing to replace the windows and doors, add fencing and paint the exterior of their home located at 120 Sunrise Drive. The subject property is legally described as LT 45 Tavernier Cove No. 1 PB1-103, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00506380-000000. (This project was tabled at the August 4, 2014 meeting).

### Applicant presentation of new material

Kaley Miller presented a packet to the board members with her comments, information from the MLS and photos from the PDF, "Discovering Tavernier." (not provided prior to the meeting)

This packet title "Historic Committee Meeting, September 8, 2014" was reviewed in detail. She explained they just want what everyone else has on the street. Everyone on the street has aluminum windows. There are no wood windows on the street. They have looked for wood windows and no one has them available. They have talked to someone (?) in the Building Department and they said no one installs wood windows and they are not warranted.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, September 8, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 2

Justin Miller explained they are having a serious bee problem and their paralyzed dog was stung and was badly swollen. No one is going to want to buy in the historic district. These requirements will hurt property values.

Their contractor was present and noted that vinyl windows do not meet the building code for 180 mph winds. He brought a Pino window and door to the meeting in his truck. He said an aluminum window would cost about \$900 as opposed to a wood window at \$3,000-\$4,000.

Ms. Miller said they are having trouble with their insurance company.

Pam Welfly (sp) said we have all been there with insurance. It is unfair to make people live in unsafe living conditions. They do have a major bee problem.

Mr. Miller said you are going to kill property values. We are replacing aluminum windows with similar aluminum windows. We have to be able to afford this. We hired people in Tavernier to advise us.

### **Board Discussion**

Ray Rhash said the windows now are replacement jalousies. We do not know what the originals were. He asked Steve Williams is the house non-contributing because the windows were replaced in the past.

Steve Williams said he does not believe this would make it non-contributing.

Ray Rhash said it says aluminum windows are not allowed and that is what we are going by. In your case I understand you have aluminum.

Donna Bosold said she has served on the preservation commission in Key West where there are the same concerns about insurance and does not understand how you could call so many manufacturers and not find a suitable product. The County Commissioners adopted these guidelines and we have to go by them.

Mr. Miller said he does not care what they do in Key West, we are in Tavernier.

Alice Allen asked Diane Silvia to refer to the guidelines for windows.

### **Windows p. 26**

The intent is to have windows that are compatible with the character of the district.

*Contributing Structures:* Windows should be maintained and repaired before considering replacement. If a historic window needs to be replaced, the new window should be built to match the original one and should be installed with matching head, sill and jamb details. Window types

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, September 8, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 3

can be casement, single hung or double hung. Jalousie or awning windows may be acceptable in appropriate historic buildings if they are original. Pivot, fixed (or picture) and horizontal slider windows are not acceptable. Added windows may be allowed on secondary elevations and should be compatible, clearly differentiated and should not alter the basic character of the historic building. Window glazing should be clear and non-reflective. Air vents may be allowed when the proportions are appropriate. Aluminum windows are not allowed.”

Ms. Miller reviewed the guidelines for windows, noting they do not mention wood. She has done hours of research on all of the houses and looked at the MLS and Building records.

Ms. Allen asked if they have any information on the door and fencing.

Ms. Miller said that is in the back of the packet. She would like a full glass or half glass door.

Ms. Allen noted the old door was wood with a window in the upper half and a door bell in the middle.

Ms. Miller said they would like a door like that on page 2 of her new packet which is located at 186 Atlantic Circle or one like that at 162 Sunrise Drive.

Mr. Miller asked when the jalousie windows would have been installed.

Ms. Allen said sometime in the 1950's.

Ms. Miller said the house is very dark inside.

The contractor said he has the actual door in the truck.

Ms. Miller said they would be paying more for the windows than the value of the house. It does not make sense.

Ms. Allen asked if they would consider something other than a full glass door.

Ms. Miller said she would take a hit on the door if she could have the windows.

Ms. Allen said this is a very significant house in the historic district. When we can save elements of the structure, it means something to the families that settled this area. She would like the door to go back with partial glass.

Ms. Allen asked about the fencing.

Ms. Miller said the fence would be vinyl, four feet high and enclose about a 200 square foot area at the rear of the property.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, September 8, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 4

Ms. Bosold said we need a site plan showing the fence location. We need to know material and style.

Mr. Miller said they have done their research.

Ms. Allen says she realizes they need to replace their windows.

Donna Bosold said it is very difficult to review a packet like this in 3 minutes at a meeting. As Ray Rhash noted, the existing windows are aluminum. The guidelines allow existing jalousie windows to be replaced with new jalousie windows.

The contractor said the door must be replaced with a fiberglass or steel door. Wood doors do not meet the impact requirements.

Ms. Bosold explained fiberglass is not an acceptable material.

Mr. Miller said they have hired a company to help them.

Ms. Bosold read the guidelines for doors into the record. Doors, page 25: "the intent is to have doors that are compatible with the character of the district. Contributing Structures: Doors should be maintained and repaired before considering replacement. If a historic door needs to be replaced, the new one should be built to match the original one and should be installed with matching head and jamb details. Doors should be hinged. Pivot or sliding doors are not acceptable. Acceptable methods of construction include wood panel doors (made of horizontal rails and vertical stiles that frame one or more panels) and single-pane French doors. Batten or flush doors are not acceptable, nor are flush doors that simulate panel doors. Screen doors hinged on front of the primary door are acceptable."

Ms. Miller said a wood door will work.

The contractor said a shutter would be required.

The group recessed to the parking lot to look at the door and window in the contractor's truck.

The meeting came back to order

**Public testimony**

Alice Allen read a letter from Mary Turick owner of 114 Sunrise Drive into the record. Ms. Turick fully supports the proposed work.

Ms. Allen then read a portion of a letter sent to the Millers by Frederick Crack owner at 125 Lowe Street. He had no objections to the proposed fence.

**Motion**

Ray Rhash motioned to approve the windows and door. There was no second so the motion failed.

Mr. Rhash made a new motion, to approve the windows, but table the door and fence so the applicants can provide more details. There was no second so the motion failed.

Donna Bosold made a two part motion. First she motioned to table the fence and the door so the applicants can provide more details. For the fence they need a site plan showing the location. This can be hand drawn off the survey. For the door it should be wood panel with upper partial glass not to exceed 1/3 of the door area. Then she motioned to approve replacing the existing jalousie windows with new jalousie windows as the guidelines allow for in-kind replacement.

Ray Rhash seconded both parts of the motion. There were no objections so the motion carried.

The contractor said they no longer make awning or jalousie windows.

Rey Ortiz said they will need to come back to the HPC for shutter design.

2. GARY THOMAS WHITE AND HEATHER DEANNE are proposing to install 1,460 square feet of pavers for a front yard driveway at their property located at 248 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as BK 9 LTS 4 and 5 Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00478030-000000.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant Presentation**

The applicant was not present.

**Board discussion**

After a brief discussion the HPC thought it was best to table this proposal so the applicant can be present to explain the project.

**Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to table. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. There were no objections so the motion carried.

3. FAITH PITTS is proposing to construct a new single family residence and install a 5' high chain link fence on the west property line at her property located on Lincoln Avenue. The subject property is legally described as BK 10 LT 10 Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida

having Real Estate Number: 00478240-000000.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant presentation**

Timothy Bricker, residential designer and Faith Pitts, property owner, presented the project.

**Public testimony**

There was no public comment.

**Board discussion**

Ray Rhash asked about the material to be used for the driveway.

Mr. Bricker said it would be gravel.

Donna Bosold asked about the planned entry door. She noted the design of the house is very nice.

Mr. Bricker said it would be wood clad with a upper half lite and six raised panels.

Alice Allen asked what is the difference between ship lap stucco siding and Hardiboard.

Mr. Bricker said Hardiboard is more labor intensive to install but it does have the wood grain appearance.

Ms. Bosold asked if they had decided on color.

Mr. Bricker said they would like the siding to be pastel blue and the fish scale portion dark blue. Trim will be white.

**Motion**

Ray Rhash motioned to approve the project as planned. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motioned carried.

**Other Business:**

Steve Williams explained that Susan Grimsley has retired and he will be taking on some of her duties. As a result of the reorganization, Peter Morris will now be taking on the HPC.

Discussion on possible revisions to Article III. Archaeological, Historical or Cultural Landmarks, Municode.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, September 8, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 7

Mr. Williams explained the County has almost completed the updated Comp Plan and are now working on the Land Development Regulations. The changes we are doing for the HPC will go into the LDR revisions and be presented as part of the overall update.

**Adjournment.**

As there was no other business, the meeting was adjourned.