

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 1, 2014 2:00

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Bert Bender

Ray Rhash

Donna Bosold, absent

Jim Clupper, absent

Staff: Peter Morris, County Attorney

Rey Ortiz, County Planner

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the November 3, 2014 meeting.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes of the November 3, 2014 meeting. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.

Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. GARY THOMAS WHITE AND HEATHER DEANNE are proposing to install 1,460 square feet of pavers for a front yard driveway at their property located at 248 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as BK 9 LTS 4 and 5 Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00478030-000000. (new hearing with required advertising)

Project could not be heard because advertising requirements were not met.

2. SUSAN PARKER, KALEY MILLER AND JUSTIN MILLER are proposing to replace the windows in their home located at 120 Sunrise Drive. The subject property is legally described as LT 45 Tavernier Cove No. 1 PB1-103, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00506380-000000.

Applicant presentation

No one was present to represent the proposed project.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 1, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 2 of 4

Board discussion

Bert Bender said this is a significant structure and deserves to be treated with compassion and attention to detail. Now they want an aluminum casement window. Aluminum is not appropriate. He asked why do they not want to use wood impact windows.

Diane Silvia said cost is a factor.

Mr. Bender said we should not consider cost, but what is appropriate for the house.

Ray Rhash said they could not find wood impact windows. One issue is that we do not know what the original windows where.

Mr. Bender said we can still determine what is appropriate. We could deny this or defer it for further discussion. He asked if we can deny the proposed Winguard PGT windows when they are not present.

Ms. Silvia pointed out we should defer rather than deny so additional fees are not charged.

Mr. Rhash said we have already approved like for like replacement.

Mr. Bender said he had no problem with like for like window replacement or with the 400 series Woodright double hung wood windows sent by the applicant in an email.

Rey Ortiz said this might be a problem because Planning may have never received that email referring to the Woodright window.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to table. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

Other Business:

Discussion on the Land Development Regulations

Peter Morris and Rey Ortiz have been working on some changes to the Land Development Regulations, including an approval matrix.

Rey Ortiz said all contributing structures should always come to you.

Ray Rhash agreed.

Bert Bender said this is the safest way. Still, we do not need to see things like re-roofing with the same or more appropriate material.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 1, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 3 of 4

Mr. Rhash said with regards to the matrix, the cleaner the better. It is best for some things to come here, like when someone added a porch. There are problems when filters are added.

Mr. Bender said decks in the rear or behind the house should be fine.

Mr. Ortiz said it needs to be black and white.

Mr. Bender said then what kind of things do you think can be staff approved?

Mr. Bender said the entries referring to new structures are redundant. New structures would come to us. Everything else would be contributing or non-contributing structures.

Mr. Ortiz said he has no problem with shutters or docks. When you say doors do you mean all doors or doors not visible from the street?

Mr. Bender said repairs on non-contributing buildings within the existing envelope can be reviewed by staff. Maintenance issues, like in kind roof replacement on contributing structures can be approved by staff.

Mr. Ortiz said roofing for contributing and non-contributing structures with in kind material is approved by staff now. Mr. Ortiz said what if they change the color.

Mr. Bender said work on a contributing structure HPC needs to see it. New structures need to come to HPC.

Mr. Ortiz said window replacement on non-contributing structures could be approved by staff. Like with aluminum awning windows replacement can be with one large impact pane in the same proportions which maintains the character.

Mr. Bender said for noncontributing structures this is okay.

Peter Morris pointed out the more discretion given to staff the more we are open to liability.

Mr. Bender said like for like work for contributing or noncontributing structures is fine.

Mr. Ortiz said it has to be clear. Sometimes people have neighbors that disapprove of the work. When we use "visible from the street" if a quarter inch of a balustrade is visible they have a case. It has to be clear.

Diane Silvia said we should combine decks, patios, and porches as they are similar elements.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 1, 2014 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 4 of 4

Mr. Rhash asked how often do we see things come here that could be staff approved?

Mr. Bender said there are things that have come to us that we did not need to see.

Mr. Ortiz said the code does not give him the option to approve something even if he likes the proposed change better.

Mr. Bender said it is not a matter of liking or disliking something, it is - does it follow the guidelines.

Ms. Silvia suggested that we add several items to the matrix. The elevation of any structure should go to HPC. We need line items added for energy saving devices, crawl space infill, and mechanical equipment (including stands/pads for mounting) for both contributing and non-contributing structures.

Mr. Ortiz said he approves a lot more than you see, like all the sewer laterals. Items that do not change the character.

Alice Allen said we have to be clear with definitions

Mr. Morris asked the HPC to review this draft matrix and make any comments or suggestions within the next week so he can get this in front of the County Commission. Comments can be sent to him or Diane.

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair.

Bert Bender nominated Alice Allen as Chair. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.

Bert Bender nominated Ray Rhash as Vice-Chair. There was no second.

Ray Rhash nominated Bert Bender as Vice-Chair. Alice Allen seconded the motion.

Adjournment.

Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.