

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday, April 6, 2015 2:00

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Donna Bosold, Commissioner Jim Clupper, and Commissioner Ray Rhash.

Staff present: Rey Ortiz, Senior Planner
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney
Barbara Bauman, Planner
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the January 5, 2015 and February 2, 2015 meetings.

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the minutes from the January 5, 2015 meeting. Alice Allen seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes from the February 2, 2015 meeting. Jim Clupper seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. HAROLD McMAHON is proposing the addition of a second story over the existing garage at his property located at 198 Lowe Street. The subject property is legally described as BK 3 AMD Plat of Tavernier Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00566320-000000. (Tabled at the meeting on February 2, 2015)

Applicant presentation of new material

David deHaas, agent and designer for the owner, presented the revised drawing requested by the HPC at the January 5, 2015 meeting. The revised drawings were done in conjunction with KGD Interiors.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Staff response

Rey Ortiz explained the envelope of the existing structure has not been changed.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday, April 6, 2015 2:00 pm
Tavernier Fire House
Page 2 of 5

Applicant response

There was no response.

Board discussion

Bert Bender noted this design depicts an appropriate three part façade.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the project as submitted. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.
Motion carried unanimously.

Although painting approval by the HPC is not required for residential structures, David deHaas said they plan to paint the exterior to match the existing structure or to use another neutral color.

2. MARY L. TURICK is proposing to replace a window AC unit with a new Mitsubishi mini split unit on the west side of her home located at 114 Sunrise Drive. The subject property is legally described as PB1-103 Key Largo Lot 47 & part Lot 48, Tavernier Cove No. 1, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00506400-000000.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Mary L. Turick, property owner, and Ross Johnson, Key West AC, were present to represent the project. They had nothing additional to add.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Staff response

Rey Ortiz said they must adhere to the flood requirements. The drawings are not as detailed as they should be.

Bert Bender said the unit needs to be a foot above flood.

Applicant response

Ross Johnson said they prefer to use bracket wall mounts.

Board discussion

There was no board discussion.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the project as submitted. Donna Bosold seconded the motion.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. KELLY ANNE CUMMINGS is proposing required measures, infiltration reduction measures, weatherization measures, and health and safety measures at her home located at 153 Tavernier Trail. Work will include replacing doors, roof repair, siding replacement, window replacement, the addition of Bahama shutters, and various other exterior and interior repairs and improvements. The subject property is legally described as LT 14 KNUST AND LANE RE-SUB PB1-146, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00506470-000000.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Kelly Anne Cummings, property owner, and Dave Jankowski, contractor, presented the project. Ms. Cummings said she is hoping to replace the existing aluminum windows with new impact windows. She would like to add shutters as a decorative element.

Bert Bender said if you do not need the shutters for impact protection, why not use wood. Is it because of lower maintenance?

Ms. Cummings said the contractor estimates it would cost the same to build wood shutters.

Mr. Bender noted, then you are asking for aluminum, louvered, Bahama shutters.

Donna Bosold asked about the proposed shutter color.

Ms. Cummings said white. She is thinking of painting the exterior of the house a pastel tan.

Peter Morris said to be careful about approving paint color as it is not on the agenda.

Rey Ortiz said no building permit is required for residential painting, and therefore, this does not come to the HPC. He asked about the window replacement and noted you are asking for like for like replacement.

Mr. Jankowski said yes, they will be the same size in the same locations.

Ms. Kelly said she is asking that the existing 15 lite French wood door be replaced as existing in wood.

Mr. Bender said the door will not be impact resistant and asked how will you protect it.

Ms. Cummings said it will have shutters.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, April 6, 2015 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 4 of 5

Mr. Jankowski said they were originally going to ask for a metal door but understood the guidelines would only allow wood for wood.

Ms. Cummings pointed out that she has replaced the wood shutters twice and would like to have the aluminum ones. She would like to do the front and driveway side like Mary Turick at 114 Sunrise Drive.

Public testimony

Mary L. Turick, owner of 114 Sunrise Drive said she commiserates with regard to the shutters.

Applicant response

Ms. Cummings said they would be Willard Bahama metal shutters in white. She may not be able to afford to install them all at once.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender said we cannot approve something you might do.

Ms. Cummings said she already has an approval for wood shutters. She would like aluminum but will settle for wood.

Mr. Jankowski said the house currently has a 15 lite wood French door.

Mr. Bender noted this is a significant home in the Historic District. The board and batten siding is an important character defining feature of the structure. Horizontal hardi-board siding is inappropriate.

Ms. Bosold said she is familiar with this weatherization program.

Mr. Bender said the existing 15 lite wood French door is not appropriate, but you are asking for like for like replacement. It does not matter to me if it is 10 lite like shown on the drawing or 15 lite. The board and batten siding is an extremely important feature of the house. Hardi-board is a cement product and is not appropriate. I can see the difference even from a far distance. The roof issue has already been resolved.

Mr. Jankowski said they are having water come in through the walls and are planning to use a double fascia, wall to gable end.

Mr. Bender said either a double fascia or one foot overhang, either of these to take care of the water intrusion.

All HPC members agreed that the siding must be wood board and batten.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, April 6, 2015 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 5 of 5

Ms. Bosold said we consistently have people asking for metal windows. In this case this is like for like replacement.

Mr. Jankowski said they are striking the four proposed gable vents from this application and will use the existing dryer vent.

The HPC members had no issue with the addition of drip caps on the windows and doors.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the proposed scope of work with the exception that any siding replacement is done in wood board and batten. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

Discussion on the Monroe County Land Development Regulations regarding the HPC.

No discussion.

Adjournment.

As there was no other business, the meeting was adjourned.