

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday August 1, 2016 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Kate DeLoach, and Commissioner Anne-Marie Victor-Howe

Staff present: Barbara Bauman, County Planner
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the July 5, 2016 meeting.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes from the July 5, 2016 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion passed unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

There were no changes to the agenda.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1 . DAVID BOERNER is proposing to replace the asphalt shingle roof with v-crimp roofing; replace the wood framed windows with aluminum impact windows; re-work the front door frame; and add a storm panel system for gable vents and doors at his house at 124 Tavern Drive. The subject property is legally described as Part of Lot 31, Block A, TAVERNIER 2, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2 at Page 8 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and being more particularly described as follows: Beginning at the SE corner of Lot 31 and running 10 feet in a Southwesterly direction, thence 75 feet in a Northwesterly direction, thence 10 feet in a Northeasterly direction, thence 75 feet in a Southeasterly direction to the Point of Beginning. Also all of Lot 32, Block A, TAVERNIER 2, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2 at Page 8 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Together with the Southerly 5.00 feet of a 10 foot alley vacated in Official Record Book 405 at Page 1100 adjacent to the Northwest portion of Lot 32 and the Northeasterly 10 feet of Lot 31, Block A, Tavernier 2, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2 at Page 8 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida and having Real Estate Number: 00555880-000000.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

David Boerner said he did know this was a contributing structure. The building was appraised at

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday August 1, 2016 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

\$57,000. With the limitations set by FEMA that allow up to 50% of the value of the structure for improvement, his budget would only allow for the aluminum windows. The roof replacement alone will be very costly. He was planning to use the aluminum impact windows and to retain the existing Bahama shutters, so the new windows would not be visible. He noted he can retain the wood trim and add aluminum sashes with mutins. If the project exceeds the 50% threshold the house will have to be elevated 2 feet.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Staff response

Diane Silvia said there are exemptions for contributing structures.

Applicant response

Mr. Boerner asked if he could add picket fencing to his current application.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said Diane is referring to Chapter 12 of the Existing Building Code. It states, that historic elements should be maintained, repaired, and lastly replaced. If replacement is necessary then the windows must be wood, as the guidelines clearly state aluminum windows are not allowed.

Mr. Boerner said the windows have to be replaced.

The HPC Commissioners viewed photographs of the home's 12 windows.

Mr. Bender pointed out that it would be much cheaper to have the windows repaired rather than replaced. He also noted that FEMA is allowing work to be done in 3-5 year increments. A private appraisal for the building would likely be much higher in value than that assigned by the Property Appraiser. He explained that the HPC does not have the capacity to make changes to the guidelines.

Peter Morris explained the HPC does not have the authority to make exceptions.

Mr. Bender asked Mr. Morris if he could make a split motion.

Mr. Morris said yes.

Part 1. Bert Bender motioned to approve the roof replacement (including fascia and soffit), door frame, and storm panel system. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion.

Part 2. Bert Bender motioned to continue the windows for up to two additional meetings so the applicant has a chance to consider alternatives to the aluminum impact windows. Anne-Marie

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday August 1, 2016 2:00 pm
Tavernier Fire House

Victor-Howe seconded the motion.

As there were no objections to Part 1 or 2 of the motion, the motion carried unanimously. David Boerner asked for an amendment to add a picket fence.

Mr. Morris explained they cannot do an amendment because the fence was not advertised.

Judy O'Hara, a neighbor at 136 Tavern Drive, said she has been in the house and it is in very poor condition. She commended Mr. Boerner for taking this project on and said it will greatly improve the neighborhood.

2. Bridget Dangel is proposing to add 50' of 4' high stockade dog-eared fencing in front of the house (Lot 2) and 50' of 4' high galvanized chain link fencing behind the hedge at the front of the adjacent lot (Lot 3) at 107 Tavern Drive. The subject property is legally described as Lots 2 and 3, Block B, TAVERNIER NO. 2, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2 at Page 8 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Numbers: 00555950-000000 and 00555960-000000.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

The applicant was not present.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe feels the entire fence should be of the traditional picket style.

Bert Bender agreed and noted a stockade- style, dog-eared fence is not appropriate.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve a traditional 4' high wood picket fence subject to applicant concurrence with this approval and submittal of a building permit application reflecting this style change. If the applicant does not concur with this decision the item can be continued for up to 60 calendar days. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

Randy Wall said he was a new property owner. He is wondering why the HPC wants double hung windows in new construction. He explained you cannot visually see a difference between single hung and double hung.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday August 1, 2016 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Bert Bender said the reason the historic preservation ordinance also pertains to new construction in the district is to protect the integrity of the historic homes. Historic homes follow a pattern, often a central door flanked by windows. Windows also have a pattern. Historic windows are usually twice as tall as they are wide and should be appropriate in size for the scale of the building.

Diane Silvia said the consultant has submitted the final report to the State for the Survey Update Grant. Once the State approves the report it will go to the BOCC for their approval. She will then have copies made for the HPC members.

Adjournment.

As there was no further business, Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Kate DeLoach seconded the motion.