



HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday March 6, 2017 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier

Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Donna Bosold, and Commissioner Anne-Marie Victor-Howe
Absent - Commissioner Kate DeLoach

Staff present: Barbara Bauman, County Planner
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the January 9, 2017 and February 6, 2017 meetings.

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the minutes from the January 9, 2017 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes from the February 6, 2017 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

There were no changes to the agenda.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

1. 86701 Overseas Highway, LLC is proposing to add a second floor to the existing single story cmu residence, replace all electrical, mechanical, and plumbing, provide new roof, and connect to the sewer at 115 Ocean View Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00555410-000100 and legally described as:

A part of Lot 10, Block 3, of Tavernier Heights Subdivision, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 180, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and being more particularly described by metes and bounds as follows: Commencing at the Southeast corner of Lot 10, Block 3, said corner to be known as the Point of Beginning of that part of Lot 10, Block 3, as hereinafter described; bear North 86 degrees, 58 minutes and 12 seconds West 40.06 feet; then bear North 69.04 feet; thence bear South 68 degrees East 43.14 feet; thence bear South 55.00 feet back to the Point of Beginning.

No one was present for the applicant.

Barbara Bauman noted the County has not received an affidavit of posting.

Bert Bender said he would need measurements and dimensions on the drawings along with flood elevations.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday March 6, 2017 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to continue. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Alice Allen said she submitted a letter to the HPC from Shirley Faye Albury and the structure is much older than what is shown in the Property Appraiser's records.

Peter Morris said these items should be communicated to staff.

2. ANDREW TOBIN is proposing revisions for construction of a previously approved, new single family residence at 243 Tavernier Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00477860-000000 and legally described as: (last January 4, 2016).

Lot 7, Block 8, LARGO BEACH, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 108, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and any other property or interest in or adjacent to said lot including any riparian or littoral rights and any filled lands.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Andrew Tobin explained that as his house was being built, it just did not look right. The windows made it look like a prison. He also extended the roof on the front to make it an overhang over the patio. The cost to do this while under construction was about \$5,000. If it were done separately it would be about \$25,000. He noted that there is also a lot of time involved between the draftsman and the contractor.

Donna Bosold asked if this was all after-the-fact.

Mr. Tobin said yes. He went on to note that the tiny railings on the one side did not look right. One side looked heavy and the other too light. He is proposing the use of concrete wall sections and railings. He will have to resubmit to the building department for these revisions.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said these elevation drawings are quite a bit different from those that were approved. The roof was sloped on the approved 10/5/15 plans. This proposal is for a flat roof.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday March 6, 2017 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Mr. Tobin said he did not think the roof slope was significant.

Mr. Bender said changing the railings is a mistake. The concrete wall sections do not create a clean line. Eliminating the roof slope is a major change.

Mr. Tobin said the roof slope is not visible from the street.

Mr. Bender said he is troubled by this.

Ms. Bosold noted it is quite a bit different.

Mr. Bender said he does not want to punish him, but does not want to reward people for doing what they want.

Ms. Bosold said you have eliminated half of the light on the side of the house.

Mr. Tobin said that side of the house will be blocked by a new three story house 5' away from his property.

Mr. Bender asked if he changed the column system because one appears to be missing.

Mr. Tobin said that was an omission in the drawing.

Ms. Bosold said this reads totally different.

Mr. Tobin said he put a sliding door in the master bedroom and that this door and windows will not be seen from the street.

Mr. Bender asked if the building was concrete block.

Mr. Tobin said yes. Changing a window to a door is not a big issue. The drawings are not much different.

Mr. Bender said you have raised the roof 2' on the one side now that the slope was eliminated.

Mr. Tobin did not feel this would be a problem.

Mr. Bender said you knew you would have to get approval. If you had come back he would have said it is a mistake to eliminate the roof slope and change the railings. It is easier to do what you want and ask for forgiveness than to ask for permission.

Mr. Tobin said he did not have time.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday March 6, 2017 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Mr. Bender said you had approval for one and a half years so you had time. You have gone too far and taken advantage.

Mr. Tobin said the whole process has been difficult. When he first came to the HPC he was trying to duplicate a historic structure. He does not feel the changes he made are a mistake. He did not feel this was a major issue.

Mr. Bender said he would not approve this. You have already built this and the design is not appropriate.

Ms. Bosold said they helped refine the design so that it followed a historic rhythm. I think what Bert is saying is that this will stand out. It looks more like South Beach.

Mr. Bender said a poor South Beach.

Mr. Tobin said he has some flexibility on the front and side windows. There is no flexibility on the roof slope or sliding door.

Mr. Bender said he is inclined to table this so he can go see what is there.

Ms. Bosold said this looks like it could be a duplex with the proposed fenestration.

Mr. Tobin said the approved windows made it look like a prison. He felt more square windows would reduce the appearance of the building height. The approved narrow windows were fixed. He was changing to square, single hung so he could open them.

Ms. Bosold said there should be a copy of the photo they were viewing on a cell phone for the file. She asked if he has a design professional working with him.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said she has a problem with this application and thinks it should be continued.

Peter Morris said on page 17 of the Guidelines referring to procedures, this requires an after-the-fact COA.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to continue this to give Mr. Tobin a chance to make modifications. This railing change is not acceptable. He asked if this was going to be a Category 5 building. If you are changing the fenestration a lot goes into this with reinforcing steel.

Mr. Tobin said there was no place for furniture on the entire left side.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday March 6, 2017 2:00 pm
Tavernier Fire House

Mr. Bender said he will look at the structure after the meeting.

Mr. Tobin said he would like to go forward with everything except the window changes.

Mr. Bender motioned to continue and for Mr. Tobin to bring back the after-the-fact drawings.

Mr. Morris said there should be two motions. One to consider an after-the-fact COA, and the other for proposed revisions.

Mr. Bender said you had a nice rhythm of solids and voids which is now mismatched. We need drawings and photos of what has been done.

1. Bert Bender motioned to continue this item to the April 10th meeting to consider an application for an after-the-fact COA. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

2. Bert Bender motioned to continue so that a plans can be submitted reflecting a new design. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

Discussion of recommendations from the Monroe County Survey Update Report
A proposed matrix will be discussed at the next meeting.

Adjournment.

Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.