



HPC

**Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission  
MINUTES  
Monday February 5, 2018  
Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier**

**2:00 PM Regular Meeting:**

**Call to Order.**

**Roll Call.**

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Donna Bosold, and Commissioner Anne-Marie Victor-Howe.

Absent were Commissioner Bert Bender and Commissioner Kate DeLoach,

Staff present: Barbara Bauman, Senior Planner  
Devin Rains, Principal County Planner  
Steven Williams, Assistant County Attorney  
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

**Adoption of Minutes from the December 4, 2017 meeting.**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the minutes from the December 4, 2017 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

**Changes to the Agenda.**

There were no changes to the agenda.

**Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness**

**1. Ballast Trail, LLC** (File 2017-138) is proposing to: replace the windows, possibly shutters, doors, and front porch ceiling; re-roof with 5 v-crimp; spalling repair; paint exterior; add lattice to cover access openings under the house; and replace and relocate the exterior HVAC unit at 133 Lowe Street within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00090220-000000 and is legally described as: **(portions of proposed work continued from the meeting of December 4, 2017):**

**PARCEL 1:**

Commencing at a point 322 feet East, and South 3° 30' West (mag) 946 feet 8 Inches from the Northwest corner of Government Lot 3, Sec. 34, Tp 62 S, R 38 E. From said point run South 3° 30' West (mag) 94 feet 8 inches. Thence run East 3° 30' South (mag) 512 feet to the waters of the Atlantic Ocean. Thence Northerly along the waters of the Ocean 94 feet 8 Inches. Thence West 3° 30' North (mag) 512 feet to the starting point. Being part of Government Lot 3, Sec. 34, Tp 62 S, R 38 E, and more particularly described as the middle third (1/3) of Lot 4 of MacDonald's Plat Government Lots 3 and 4 and W 1/2 of NW 1/4 Sec. 34, Tp 62 S, R 38 E, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 80, Monroe County Records.

Also the Easterly 15 feet of Lot 10 (Samuel C. Williams) lying Northerly of the line between Lot 4 and Lot 5 according to said plat, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 80, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Together with an easement for ingress and egress being described as the Easterly 15 feet of the portion of Lot 9, Plat Book 1, at page 80, lying westerly of and adjacent to the middle third of Lot 4.

**PARCEL 2:**

A parcel of land being a portion of Lot 4, of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 and the West half of the Northwest Quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 80 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Beginning at the Southeast corner of Lot 30, Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the said Public Records, run S 86 degrees 22' 36" E along the Southerly line of the said Tavernier Cove for approximately 210 feet to the shoreline of the Atlantic Ocean; thence meander Southerly along the said shoreline for 95 feet more or less to an intersection with the Northerly line of the "middle one-third (1/3) of Lot Four" according to deed description recorded in Deed Book D-1, Page 299 of the said Public Records; thence run N 86 degrees 22' 23" W along the said Northerly line of the "middle one-third (1/3) of Lot Four" for approximately 205 feet to an intersection with a line bearing S 3 degrees 37' 24" W from the Point of Beginning; thence run N 3 degrees 37' 24" E along the said line, the same being the Easterly line of a Southerly prolongation thereof, of the STICKNEY parcel (OR 783-1947), for 94.82 feet to the Point of Beginning of the herein described parcel of land.

AND

A parcel of land being a portion of Lot 4, of " PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 and the West half of the Northwest quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 80 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Commencing at the Southeast corner of Lot 30, Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the said Public Records, run N 86 degrees 22' 36" W along the Southerly line of the said Tavernier Cove for 104.99 feet to the Point of Beginning of the herein described parcel of land.

From the said Point of Beginning continue N 86 degrees 22' 36" W along the said Southerly line of the said Tavernier Cove for 189.72 feet to the Northwest corner of the said Lot 4, of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD"; thence run S 3 degrees 37' 51" W along the Westerly line of the said Lot 4 of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD" for 79.80

feet; thence run S 86 degrees 22' 23" E along a line 15 feet Northerly of, (as measured along a perpendicular), and parallel with the Northerly line of the "middle one-third (1/3) of Lot Four", according to deed description recorded In Deed Book D-1, Page 299 of the said Public Records for 189.72 feet; thence run N 3 degrees, 37' 51" E along the Westerly line of the STICKNEY parcel (OR 783-1947) for 79.81 feet to the Point of Beginning of the herein described parcel of land.

AND

A parcel of land being a portion of Lots 4, 9 and 10, of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 and the West half of the Northwest quarter in section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 80 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

A 15.00 feet wide parcel being a portion of Lots 4, 9, and 10 of the hereinabove mentioned Plat of the Amos Lowe Homestead, said parcel lying within 7.50 feet of the following described centerline;

Commencing at the Southeast corner of Lot 30, Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 103 of the said Public Records, run S 3 degrees 37' 24" W along the westerly side of a Southerly prolongation of Tarpon Street as shown on the said Tavernier Cove plat for 87.32 feet to the Point of Beginning of the herein described centerline; From the said Point of Beginning run N 86 degrees 22' 23" W along a line 7.50 feet (as measured on a perpendicular) Northerly of and parallel with the Northerly line of the "middle one-third (1/3) of Lot Four" for 302.20 feet; thence run S 3 degrees 37' 51" W along a line 7.50 feet (as measured along a perpendicular) Westerly of and parallel with the Westerly line of the said Lot 4, Amos Lowe Homestead for 102.30 feet; thence continue S 3 degrees 37' 51" W along the last mentioned course and along a line 7.50 feet Westerly of (as measured on a perpendicular) and parallel with the Westerly line of Sunny Haven according to the plat thereof recorded In Plat Book 1 at Page 185 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida for 79.67 feet to the Northerly side of a 15.00 feet wide unnamed street according to deed description recorded Deed Book G-13 at Page 137 of the said Public Records, the same being the Point of Ending of the hereinabove described center line.

LESS:

The Easterly 15 feet of Lot 10 (Samuel C. Williams) lying Northerly of the line between Lot 4 and Lot 5 according to said Plat, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 80, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, (as described in conveyance to Grogan OR 740-171)

**PARCEL 3:**

A parcel of land being a portion of Lot 4, of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 and the West half of the Northwest quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the plat thereof

recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 80 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Beginning at the Southeast corner of Lot 30, Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof recorded In Plat Book 1 at Page 103 the said Public Records, run N 86 degrees 22' 36" W along the Southerly line of the said Tavernier Cove for 104.99 feet; thence run S 3 degrees 37' 51" W for 79.81 feet; thence run S 86 degrees 22' 23" E along a line 15.00 feet Northerly of, (as measured along a perpendicular), and parallel with the Northerly line of the "middle one-third (1/3) of Lot Four", according to deed description recorded In Deed Book 1at Page 299 of the said Public Records for 105.00 feet; thence run N 3 degrees, 37' 24" E along a Southerly prolongation of the Westerly line of Tarpon Street as shown on the said Tavernier Cove plat for 79.82 feet to the Point of Beginning of the hereinabove described parcel of land.

**PARCEL 4:**

A parcel of land being a portion of Lot 9 and Lot 10, of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 and the West half of the Northwest quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1at Page 80 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Commencing at the Southeast corner of Lot 30, Tavernier Cove, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the said Public Records, run N 86 degrees 22' 36" W along the Southerly line of the said Tavernier Cove for 294.71 feet to the Northwest corner of Lot 4 of said " PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", and the Point of Beginning of the herein described parcel of land. From the said Point of Beginning, run S 3 degrees 37' 51" W along the Westerly side of said Lot 9 of said "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD" for 79.80 feet; thence run N 86 degrees 22' 23" W. for 15.00 feet; thence run S 3 degrees 37' 51" W along a line 15.00 feet, {as measured along a perpendicular) Westerly of and parallel with the Westerly line of the said Lots 9 and 10 of the said "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", for 89.47 feet; thence run along the Northerly and Northeasterly sides of a previously described Milazzo parcel (OR 784-119) for the following two (2) Courses: (1) N 86 degrees 22' 09" W, 87.59 feet (2) N 47 degrees 30' 35" W,37.14 feet; thence run N 42 degrees 29' 25" E along a Northeasterly prolongation of the Northwesterly line of the said Milazzo parcel for 58.13 feet to the dividing line between the said Lots 9 and 10 of the said "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD"; thence run N 47 degrees 22' 36" W along the said dividing line for 159.98 feet to the point of Intersection of the Southwesterly and Southerly lines of the said Tavernier Cove; thence run S 86 degrees 22' 36" E along the Southerly line of the said Tavernier Cove for 219.38 feet to the Point of Beginning of the herein described parcel of land.

**PARCEL 5:**

A parcel of land being a portion of Lot 10 of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD" consisting of Lots 3 and 4 of the West half of the Northwest Quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the Plat thereof,

recorded In Plat Book 1, at Page 80, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Parcel C: Commencing at the intersection of the Southwesterly side of the said Lot 10 with the Southeasterly Right-of-Way line of State Road No. 5 (U.S. Highway No. 1), run South 47 degrees 30' 35" East along the Southwesterly side of the said Lot 10, the same being the Northeasterly side of Lowe Street, for 552.33 feet to the Point of Beginning; thence continue in a Southeasterly direction 176.10 feet; thence run North 42 degrees 2.9' 25" East for 158.13 feet to the extension of the Southwesterly line of Tavernier Cove, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded In Plat Book 1, at Page 103, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida; thence run Northwesterly along said extension of the Southwesterly line of Tavernier Cove, North 47 degrees 22' 36" West for 176.10 feet; thence run South 42 degrees 29' 25" West for 158.54 feet to the Point of Beginning.

**PARCEL 6:**

A Parcel of land being a portion of Lot 10 of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 of the West half of the Northwest Quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 80, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

PARCEL B: Commencing at the intersection of the Southwesterly side of the said Lot 10 with the Southeasterly Right-of-Way Line of State Road No. 5 (U.S. Highway No. 1), run South 47 degrees 30' 35" East along the Southwesterly side of the said Lot 10, the same being the Northeasterly side of Lowe Street for 376.17 feet to the Point of Beginning; thence continue In a Southeasterly direction along the Northeasterly side of Lowe Street, South 47 degrees 30' 35" East for 176.16 feet; thence run North 42 degrees 29' 25" East for 158.54 feet to the Southwesterly line of Tavernier Cove, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 103, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida; thence run in a Northwesterly direction, along said Southwesterly line of Tavernier Cove, North 47 degrees 22' 36" West for 176.16 feet; thence run South 42 degrees 29' 25" West for 158.95 feet to the Point of Beginning.

**PARCEL 7 (overall boundary):**

A Parcel of land being portions of Lots 4, 9 and 10 of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 of the West half of the Northwest Quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the Plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 80 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said parcel 7 consisting of Parcels 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 as described in Title Insurance Commitment No. 19417005 issued by National Title Insurance Company, effective April 29, 2011; said Parcel 7 being further described as follows:

Commencing at the intersection of the southwesterly side of the said Lot 10 with the southeasterly right of way line of the Overseas Highway (US Highway No. 1), run S 47°30'35" E along the southwesterly side of the said Lot 10, the same being the northeasterly side of Lowe

Street for 376.17 feet to the most westerly corner of Parcel 5 of said Title Commitment and the Point of Beginning. From said Point of Beginning thence continue in a southeasterly direction along the northeasterly side of Lowe Street S 47°30' 35" E for 352.26 feet to the most southerly corner of said Parcel 5; thence N 42°29'25" E along the southeasterly line of said Parcel 5 for 100 feet to the southerly line of Parcel 4 of said Title Commitment; thence S 47°30' 35"E along said southerly line for 37.14 feet; thence S 86°22'09" E along said southerly line for 87.59 feet to the west line of the easterly 15 feet of said Lot 10 of said plat recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 80 of said public records; thence S 3°37'51" W along said west line for 100.00 feet to the north right of way line of a 15 feet wide un-named street according to the plat of Sunny Haven recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 185 of said public records (AKA: Beach Road); thence S 86° 22'09" E along said right of way line for 15.00 feet to the southwest corner of Lot 9 according to said plat of Sunny Haven; thence N 3°37'51" E along the west line of said Lot 9 of Sunny Haven for 79.67 feet to the northwest corner of said Lot 9 of Sunny Haven, thence S 86°22'09" E along the north line of said plat of Sunny Haven and the south line of the middle 1/3 of Lot 4 of said plat of Amos Lowe Homestead recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 80 of said public records for 512 feet, more or less, to the shoreline of the Atlantic Ocean; thence meander northerly along said shoreline for 189.34 feet to the north line of the north 1/3 of said Lot 4 of said Lowe Homestead plat; thence N 47°30' 35" W along said northeasterly line for 192.59 feet to the most northerly corner of said Parcel 6 according to said Title Insurance Commitment; thence S 42°29'25" W along the northwesterly line of said Parcel 6 for 158.95 feet to the Point of Beginning.

#### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

#### **Applicant presentation**

Krissy Lynn, applicant's agent, presented NOA's for aluminum impact windows and aluminum French doors.

#### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

#### **Board discussion**

Alice Allen said the shutters had been an important characteristic of this house.

Krissy Lynn agreed that they would install shutters.

Donna Bosold said it is probably best that we review each of these items on the list. She does not object to aluminum impact windows since Red Cross houses originally had steel windows, as long as wood shutters in the original style are used.

Ms. Lynn said they will replace the porch railing like it was originally and that the porch posts will remain.

Ms. Bosold said we cannot accept of white roof. V-crimp is fine.

Ms. Lynn agreed to that the v-crimp roof will have a galvalume, mill finish.

Ms. Allen said this is one of the most important houses in the district. Everything should be as close to the original as possible.

The Commission had no issues with moving the HVAC unit or with the lattice infill.

Diane Silvia said the application states wood panel doors and we have just received NOA's for aluminum French doors.

Ms. Bosold said we have two different requests here.

Alice Allen said aluminum French doors are not appropriate for this house. The doors should be wood panel doors.

Ms. Lynn asked about painting the exterior of the house.

The Commission agreed white was most appropriate.

Diane Silvia said the applicant is also requesting replacement of a chain link fence but it was not advertised.

Barbara Bauman had noted the fence was not permitted.

Ms. Allen said we cannot consider it.

Ms. Bauman asked if they were including the spalling repair.

Ms. Allen said yes.

### **Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the proposed project with the conditions that: the roof has a galvalume/mill finish; the wood shutters are replaced; wood panel doors are used; and the house is painted white. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

**2. 91991 Overseas Highway, LLC** (File 2017-133) is proposing to install a paver driveway and parking area at 91991 Overseas Highway, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00089930-000000 and legally described as:

The SouthWest one-half of Lot 14, according to the Plat or diagram drawn by George L. McDonald,  
Plat Book 1, Page 64 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, as more particularly

described the SouthWest one-half of Lot 14, according to the Plat or diagram drawn by George L. McDonald of the SouthEast quarter of the NorthEast quarter and Government Lot 2, and the SouthWest quarter of the SouthEast quarter of Section 27 and Government Lots 1 and 2 of Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, which Plat or diagram is duly recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 64 of Monroe County Records; Commencing at the NorthWesterly corner of said Lot 14 and running from thence in a NorthEasterly direction along its Northerly boundary 90 feet and 3 inches, more or less to the section line; thence tum Easterly and run along the section line in an Easterly direction 32 feet and 3 inches more or less to a point dividing said Lot 14 into two equal parts if said line were drawn through said lot running from NorthWest to SouthEast thence at right angles along said imaginary line in a SouthEasterly direction 432 feet more or less to the Atlantic Ocean; thence along the Atlantic Ocean in a meandering line in a SouthWesterly direction 113 feet more or less to the Westerly line of said Lot 14; thence at right angles in a NorthWesterly direction along said Westerly line of said Lot 470 feet more or less to the Point of Beginning. Together with all riparian rights pertaining thereto.

### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

### **Applicant presentation**

Don Horton, agent for the applicant, presented the project. He said all of the pavers are behind the privacy wall. He brought one the pavers and pointed out that the finish resembles gravel and there is a ridge along the sides which allow drainage. There are also the required swales, planters and a landscape buffer around the property.

### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

### **Board discussion**

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said these pavers do not follow the guidelines, as they are not pervious. The character of the historic district was very simple and it should stay that way.

Mr. Horton said water goes through the joints and into the planted areas. The owners are elderly and these pavers provide a smooth surface.

Donna Bosold asked if this was an accessibility issue.

Alice Allen asked Steve Williams for an opinion.

Mr. Williams said it is your interpretation of the guidelines.

Ms. Allen said her only issue is drainage.

Mr. Horton said it drains well and is on a sand base.

Robert Cooke said at last month's meeting you asked a gentleman to put in pavers instead of



brick so I don't know how you could deny this.

Ms. Bosold said she agrees we need to be consistent, but there are a lot of different pavers with differing amounts of permeability.

### **Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve. Alice Allen seconded the motion.

Donna Bosold and Alice Allen were in favor of the motion. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe objected to the motion. Therefore, the motion carried.

**3. Garret and Gail Boekel** (File 2017- 158) are proposing to construct a new, one-story, single family residence at the property located at 198 Beach Road, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00557130-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 5 and Lot 4 Less the East 16 feet, SUNNY HAVEN, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 185, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

### **Applicant presentation**

Tim Bricker, project designer, presented the project. He agreed with the staff report.

### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

### **Board discussion**

Donna Bosold and Anne-Marie Victor-Howe both felt the scale was very appropriate.

Alice Allen said her only concern is that the windows and the doors are all the same height. She thinks that changing the height of the windows a little would make them less imposing.

Mr. Bricker showed a photo of a house in Louisiana that was done in a similar style and said this is what the owners want. It is the style of the house and is not uncommon.

Tim Jorgenson, the owner's son, said we could put a transom. The color scheme may also help.

Ms. Allen said she has no issue with color. She asked if they are going to add a porch railing.

Mr. Bricker said they do not want a porch railing which is why he has the height at 29 inches. There will be a railing on the stairs.

### **Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the proposed project as planned. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe

seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

**4. Louis Garcia, Jr.** (File 2018-006) is proposing to install 485 linear feet of 4' high PVC picket fencing with three gates at 208 Tarpon Street, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00506130-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 24 and the North 50 feet of Lot 23, TAVERNIER COVE, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and that portion of the tract of land designated "Promenade (Private)" on the plat of TAVERNIER COVE, recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, which lies between the Atlantic Ocean and Lot 24 of TAVERNIER COVE, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, said portion of said "Promenade" being bounded on the Easterly side of the Atlantic Ocean on the Westerly side by the Easterly boundary of Lot 24 of TAVERNIER COVE, as aforesaid on the Northerly side by the extension of the Northerly line of said Lot 24, Easterly to the Atlantic Ocean, and the Southerly side by the extension of the Southern line of said Lot 24 Easterly to the Atlantic Ocean.

AND

Lots 24 and 26, and the South 100 feet of Lot 23, TAVERNIER COVE, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 103 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida. Together with the 10 feet by 100 feet "driveway" between Lots 23, 25 and 26; and the tract designated "Promenade (Private)" in front of Lots 23, 25 and 26. Less the Westerly 2.5 feet of Lot 23, according to the plat of said TAVERNIER COVE, and that part of said Lot 23, which is included in the external area formed by a 15 foot arc tangent to the South line of Lot 23 and tangent to a line 2/5 feet Easterly of and parallel to the West line of said Lot 23.

#### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

#### **Applicant presentation**

Louis Garcia, Jr., owner, said he has nothing further.

#### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

#### **Board discussion**

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said she hopes the fence will be on his property line. They have to watch the tide for seven months to determine the true high tide mark, and that is your property line.

Donna Bosold asked for more information about the survey as it was a small copy and difficult

to read.

Mr. Garcia said this is a current survey and brought a full sized copy of the survey to show the Commission. He said the fence will not be on the promenade.

Alice Allen said she has an issue with using PVC fencing. Wood fencing is appropriate and lasts a long time. Her fence is wood.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said she also has wood fencing.

Mr. Garcia said it matches the neighbor's fence and that of the house behind it.

Michael Reid, the applicant's agent, said PVC fencing is very durable and requires no maintenance as compared to wood. Chain link is the alternative.

Ms. Allen said she does not believe we have the basis to deny it.

### **Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the proposed fence as planned. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

**5. Michael Jones** (File 2018-007) is proposing to demolish an elevated deck and construct a 488 square foot addition at 154 Coconut Row, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00477430-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 7, Block 3, LARGO BEACH, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 108, of the public records of Monroe County, Florida.

### **Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

### **Applicant presentation**

Michael Jones, father of the owner and attorney, was there to represent the project.

### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

### **Board discussion**

The Commission agreed this was a modest, properly scaled addition.

### **Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the proposed project as planned. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

**6. Kyle and Kristina Steputis** (File 2018-008) are proposing to remove and replace existing wood stair construction, with new matching existing at 130 Ocean View Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00555470-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 6, Block 4, TAVERNIER HEIGHTS, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 180, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant presentation**

Kristina Steputis, owner, had nothing further.

**Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

**Board discussion**

There was no board discussion.

**Motion**

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the proposed project as planned. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. As there were no objections, the motion carried unanimously.

**7. Robert Cooke** (File 2018-009) is proposing to demolish the existing residence and reconstruct the building in the same location at 131 Ocean View Drive, within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, having real estate number: 00555350-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 5, Block 3, TAVERNIER HEIGHTS, a subdivision in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East on the Island of Key Largo, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 180, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

**Staff presentation and recommendation**

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

**Applicant presentation**

Robert Cooke, owner, and Amy Stone, designer, presented the project.

Ms. Stone presented a packet with revised drawings. She wants to stay in the same footprint with the same quaintness.

Mr. Cooke said this was the first house his mother lived in when she moved down. He does not want to tear it down but he cannot bring it back to code under the 50% rule. A tree fell on it and it moved two feet. He wants the replacement structure to look the same.

Ms. Stone said it fell off its' piers and has lost its' integrity. She asked, did I understand we cannot replicate the historic house. By raising the house a foot and adding little porches as shown in these new drawings it will not be an exact replica.

### **Public testimony**

There was no public testimony.

### **Board discussion**

Donna Bosold said she concurs with staff, the new construction cannot replicate the historic house. She asked who determined the damage exceeded the 50% rule. Was it an insurance company or the building department? This is a gray area for us with no documentation. Currently we are dealing with Pigeon Key which had two buildings knocked off their foundations and they are not permitted to be demolished.

Mr. Cooke asked if she had seen the building.

Ms. Bosold said yes, she went there today.

Mr. Cooke said the back wall is gone.

Ms. Bosold said an engineer or architect should evaluate the historic structure to verify its condition.

Amy Stone asked if she needed a letter from the engineer that signed the drawings.

Ms. Bosold said we need some professional verification as to the condition.

Ms. Stone said the building is unsafe.

Steve Williams advised not discussing substantial damage. He said they should request an inspection by the building department to see if it is deemed unsafe.

Mr. Cooke said he has read the guidelines and did not think he would have to come to a meeting at all since he wanted to reconstruct the exact building.

### **Motion**

This application was continued to allow time for a professional evaluation of the condition of the structure.

### **Other Business:**

Discussion on the recommendations from the Monroe County Survey Update Report

Jamie Engel, resident at 138 Ocean View Drive, asked when the issue of staff approvals is going to the BOCC. It was not on the agenda for the last meeting. There is no excuse for this. She will keep coming to meetings until this is resolved.

Steve Williams said he will speak with Peter Morris. Mr. Morris can respond to Diane and she can get back with you.

**Adjournment.**

Alice Allen motioned to adjourn.