

HPC

Historic Preservation Commission

Monroe County

Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

September 12, 2022

Staff Report

143 ATLANTIC CIRCLE DRIVE

JUAN R. RAVELO (FILE #2022-109) IS SEEKING APPROVAL TO REPLACE ROOFING AT THE EXISTING HOUSE WITH VCRIMP ROOFING AND GUTTER SYSTEM AND CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AT 143 ATLANTIC CIRCLE DRIVE, WITHIN THE TAVERNIER HISTORIC DISTRICT, HAVING PARCEL IDENTIFICATION NUMBER 00090060-000000 AND DESCRIBED AS PART OF LOT 17, ACCORDING TO GEORGE L. MCDONALD PLAT OF SUBDIVISION OF THE ALBURY PROPERTY ON KEY LARGO, ACCORDING TO THE PLAT THEREOF, AS RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 1, PAGE 64 OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF MONROE COUNTY, FLORIDA.

History and Architecture of the Building

143 Atlantic Circle Drive is a contributing, one story masonry vernacular structure built in 1957, as recorded in the property appraiser's records.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (p.9)

Standard 9: "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."

Standard 10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Appendix B Florida Building Code for Existing Buildings: New Additions to Historic Buildings from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

Recommended: Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Not Recommended: Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the

historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Tavernier Historic District Preservation Guidelines

Roofing (p. 24) “The intent is to keep a uniformity of roofing materials in the district... Roofing materials include standing seam metal, v-crimp, stamped metal and composition tile.”

Height (page 20)

“The intent is to maintain the scale of the district by assessing the height of new buildings in relation to adjacent historic structures. Additions should not obscure the volume of the historic building: the addition may surpass in height the height of the historic building if it is determined during review that the addition does not obscure or adversely affect the structure or the historic scale of the historic district.”

Building Base Height (page 22)

“The intent is to encourage the additions to historic buildings to be constructed at the same finished floor elevation as the original building... In general, both additions to contributing structures and new buildings should be built at the minimum flood level and not above if possible and subject to design requirements for flooding due to hurricanes.”

Analysis

The design of the proposed addition has been revised by lowering the overall height to 21’8”. The finished floor height is still above the required design flood elevation and would provide 7’6” of open space below.

The existing structure is 1,062 square feet in size. The proposed addition has now been appropriately scaled in relation to the historic house, at the reduced size of 561.66 square feet in size.

Approval is recommended as the addition size is appropriately proportioned and differentiated from the historic house. Although, this addition does not follow the guidelines regarding building base height, it should be noted that an approval based on the fact that the overall height difference between the historic structure and the new addition is not considerable. With this approach, the decision may not set a precedence for future proposed elevated additions to exceed design flood height.

Approval of the metal roof and gutter system on the historic house is also recommended.