

HPC

Historic Preservation Commission

Monroe County

Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

September 12, 2022

Staff Report

91865 OVERSEAS HIGHWAY, LLC (File #2022-143) IS SEEKING APPROVAL TO REPLACE ROOFING WITH BLACK STANDING SEAM ROOFING AT THE HOTEL STRUCTURE AND THE SMALL ACCUPUNTURE BUILDING, INSTALL PAVERS AND RE-APPLY ASPHALT AS PER SITE PLAN, AND RE-STUCCO, PAINT, AND REPLACE ALL WINDOWS AND DOORS WITH NEW IMPACT WINDOWS AND DOORS AT ALL FIVE STRUCUTRES AT 91865 OVERSEAS HIGHWAY, WITHIN THE TAVERNIER HISTORIC DISTRICT, MONROE COUNTY, FLORIDA, HAVING PARCEL IDENTIFICATION NUMBER 00555610-000000 AND DESCRIBED AS A PARCEL OF LAND WITHIN SECTION 34, TOWNSHIP 62 SOUTH, RANGE 83 EAST, MONROE COUNTY, FLORIDA.

History and Architecture of the Buildings

This property contains a complex of significant historic structures originally developed by H.S. McKenzie. These 1930's structures included the Tavernier Theatre (which became the Tavernier Hotel), the Old Tavern Tea Room, the Tavern Store (which was later the Copper Kettle Restaurant), and the Standard Oil Gas Station (now the Acupuncture building). These buildings were listed as Monroe County Historical and Cultural Landmarks in 1996. It appears that after-the-fact impact windows and doors have been installed at each of these buildings. Exterior colors for these buildings follow the existing.

The building identified as the "Show Room" on the site plan provided, dates to 1936 according to the Property Appraiser's Records. This was recorded in 2003 as the Old Tavern Tea Room. At that time, it was noted that the doors and windows had been replaced and did not follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. They are proposing to finish the front elevation in smooth blue stucco and the rear siding with white paint.

The Tavernier Hotel, identified as the "Rooms Building" on the site plan, was built in 1936 according to the Property Appraiser's Records and is a significant contributing structure. Currently this building has an asphalt shingle roof. The proposal here is to replace the roof with black metal standing seam roofing. The exterior will be finished in smooth, pink colored stucco with white trim. When recorded in 2003 it was noted that the windows were wood six over six, double hung and jalousie.

The building identified as "Acupuncture & Advanced Aesthetics" is a small 348 square foot building with an asphalt shingle roof. Historically, this was the Standard Oil Gas Station. This application includes a proposal for a black metal standing seam roof and a yellow exterior stucco finish with white trim.

The flat roofed building on the site plan identified as “Commercial Building” will be finished in pink stucco with white trim.

The building identified on the site plan as “Café Mocha” was recorded in 2003 as the Copper Kettle Restaurant. At that time, it was noted that there had been alterations to exterior materials and windows that did not follow the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The proposal here is to paint the existing surfaces white.

Relevant Standards and Guidelines

From the Tavernier Historic District Preservation Guidelines

Driveways: (p. 20) “Driveways are not a requirement in the historic district; however, should a driveway be needed, it should be finished with crushed shell, gravel, or other pervious surface.”

Doors (p. 25) “Contributing Structures: Doors should be compatible with the character of the district. Doors should be maintained and repaired before considering replacement. If a historic door needs to be replaced, the new one should be built to match the original one and should be installed with matching head and jamb details. Doors should be hinged. Pivot or sliding doors are not acceptable. Acceptable methods of construction include wood panel doors (made of horizontal rails and vertical stiles that frame one or more panels) and single-pane French doors,”

Windows (p. 26) “Contributing Structures: Windows should be compatible with the character of the district. Windows should be maintained and repaired before considering replacement. If a historic window needs to be replaced, the new window should be built to match the original one and should be installed with matching head, sill and jamb details. Window types can be casement, single hung or double hung. Jalousie or awning windows may be acceptable in appropriate historic buildings if they are original... Aluminum windows are not allowed.”

Roofing (p. 24) “The intent is to keep a uniformity of roofing materials in the district... Roofing materials include standing seam metal, v-crimp, stamped metal and composition tile.”

Exterior Walls (p. 24) “The intent is to maintain uniformity of material for exterior walls in the district... stucco may be acceptable but will be reviewed on an individual basis.”

From the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (p.9)

Standard 9: “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”

Standard 10: “New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”

Analysis

While metal standing seam roofing is a permissible roofing material, there is no precedence for a black metal roof anywhere in the Tavernier Historic District. A natural galvalume mill finish is recommended for these significant historic structures.

Re-stuccoing on the buildings should be limited to areas already in stucco that need repair and should be minimal as not to erase the existing rough finish, which is a character defining feature of these buildings.

Impact door and window replacement appear to be after the fact.